



Commission on Forensic Science

June 12, 2026

Division of Criminal Justice Services
80 South Swan Street, Crime Stat Room 118, Albany, NY 12210

Video Conference Locations:
445 Hamilton Avenue, Suite 1203, White Plains, NY 10601
40 Washington Square South, New York, NY
1 Ashburton Pl Suite 2133, Boston, MA

09:02 AM – 2:07 PM

DRAFT MEETING MINUTES

Commission Members in Attendance:

Col. Nicholas Banbury
James Chithalen, Ph.D.¹
Lydia de Castro
Steven Epstein, Esq.
William Fitzpatrick, Esq.
Jessica Goldthwaite, Esq.
Michael Marciano, Ph.D.
Erin Murphy, Esq.
Scott O'Neill, Ph.D.
Shelley Palmer
Beverly Rauch
Rossana Rosado
Michelli Schmitz
Ann Willey, Ph.D.

DCJS Staff in Attendance:

Taylor Aaron
Dean DeFruscio
Colleen Glavin, Esq.
Katherine Mayberry
Joseph Popcun
Brianna Robinson
Lindsey Rockwell
Matthew Schrantz, Esq.

¹ Representative of Commission Member James V. McDonald, M.D.

Kerry Shermer
Elizabeth Suparmanto

Other Attendees:

Julia Becker - New York State Police Crime Laboratory
 Kyle Beckmann - Rockland County Sheriff's Office Latent Print Unit
 Jamie Belrose - New York State Police Crime Laboratory
 Jeff Branagan - Monroe County Sheriff's Office Latent Print Laboratory
 Arthur Connolly - Rockland County Sheriff's Office Latent Print Unit
 Anthony Di Lallo - New York State Police Crime Laboratory
 Meegan Fitzpatrick - New York State Police Crime Laboratory
 Rane Ho - Onondaga County Center for Forensic Sciences
 Jonathan Hogg - New York State Police Crime Laboratory
 Christopher Hoyt - New York State Police Crime Laboratory
 Michelle Hunsinger - Monroe County Sheriff's Office Latent Print Laboratory
 Nichole Hurbanek - New York State Police Crime Laboratory
 Jolin Koch - New York State Police Crime Laboratory
 Joseph Lang - New York State Police Crime Laboratory
 Tom Leach - New York State Police Crime Laboratory
 Mary Maltbie - New York State Police Crime Laboratory
 Julie Pizziketti - New York State Police Crime Laboratory
 Anthula Vandoros - New York State Police Crime Laboratory
 Christian Westring - Niagara County Sheriff's Office Forensic Laboratory

Chair Rosado opened the meeting by welcoming back new member Dr. Scott O'Neill, who is filling the New York State Forensic Laboratory Director seat and previously served on the Commission on Forensic Science as the NYCLAC chair. Chair Rosado stated that she was attending virtually, and that Ms. Palmer would run the meeting.

*Approximate
video times*

00:00:23 –
00:00:54

Ms. Palmer proceeded to take a roll call as members were in attendance in Albany and virtually. A quorum was established with 13 voting members (Banbury, de Castro, Epstein, Fitzpatrick, Goldthwaite, Marciano, Murphy, O'Neill, Palmer, Rauch, Rosado, Schmitz, and Willey).

00:00:55 –
00:01:30

Ms. Palmer then requested a motion to approve the June 12, 2026, agenda. Mr. Epstein made a motion to add additional discussion related to recent policy developments for the Department of Health regarding private forensic laboratories to the Old Business section of the agenda. The motion to amend the agenda was seconded by Ms. de Castro and approved with 12 votes (Banbury, de Castro, Epstein, Fitzpatrick, Goldthwaite, Marciano, Murphy, O'Neill, Palmer, Rosado, Schmitz, and Willey) and one abstention (Rauch). The motion to approve the agenda with the amendments was made by Mr. Fitzpatrick, seconded by Mr. Epstein and approved unanimously.

00:01:34 –
00:02:57

Then Ms. Palmer requested a motion to approve the minutes of the March 13, 2026, Commission meeting. The motion to approve the minutes was made by Ms. de Castro, seconded by Mr. Epstein, and approved with 12 votes (Banbury, de Castro, Epstein,

00:02:58 –
00:03:27

Fitzpatrick, Goldthwaite, Marciano, Murphy, Palmer, Rauch, Rosado, Schmitz, and Willey) and one abstention (O'Neill).

Ms. Palmer then requested a motion to enter Executive Session to discuss matters relating to a current investigation or matters that may lead to the appointment, promotion, demotion, discipline, or suspension of a particular person. The motion was made by Ms. de Castro, seconded by Dr. Marciano, and was approved with 12 votes (Banbury, de Castro, Epstein, Fitzpatrick, Marciano, Murphy, O'Neill, Palmer, Rauch, Rosado, Schmitz, and Willey), and 1 opposed (Goldthwaite). The Commission adjourned into Executive Session at 9:06am.

00:03:28 –
00:04:19

Executive Session concluded and the Commission reconvened at 11:37am. Ms. Palmer stated that the working group, previously established to address an anonymous complaint received regarding the Onondaga County Center for Forensic Sciences Laboratory, would continue to meet and provide an improvement action plan focused on technical and management matters by September.

00:04:27 –
00:05:46

The next agenda item to be reviewed was Accreditation/Laboratory Updates. Considering time restraints, initial matters regarding the following laboratories were considered: Erie County Central Police Services Forensic Laboratory and the New York State Police Crime Laboratory. Representatives from the laboratories were available in person or via Zoom to respond to members' questions.

00:05:50 –
01:56:20

The Commission reviewed the final documentation from the ANAB reaccreditation assessment activity of the Erie County Central Police Services Forensic Laboratory. Dr. Marciano made a motion to accept the binding recommendation of the DNA Subcommittee and issue full renewal of the laboratory's New York State Accreditation for a period concurrent with their ANAB accreditation. Mr. Fitzpatrick seconded the motion. The motion was approved with 10 votes (Banbury, de Castro, Epstein, Fitzpatrick, Marciano, O'Neill, Palmer, Rauch, Rosado, and Willey), 2 aye votes with comment (Goldthwaite and Murphy), and 1 abstention (Schmitz).

00:05:55 –
00:13:52

Commissioner Rosado left the meeting at 12:16pm. The Commission then discussed the New York State Police Crime Laboratory agenda items. The Commission first revisited the binding recommendation from the DNA Subcommittee that was discussed at the December 12, 2025, meeting regarding the use of Next Generation Sequencing. Mr. Schrantz provided clarification on the regulatory structure and recommendations of the DNA Subcommittee. The New York State Police Crime Laboratory Acting Director, Julie Pizziketti, then presented additional information on the laboratory's planned use and policies and procedures surrounding Next Generation Sequencing. After a lengthy discussion, Mr. Fitzpatrick made a motion to accept the binding recommendation from the DNA Subcommittee and approve the use of Next Generation Sequencing using the MiSeq FGx system with the Forenseq Kintelligence Kit by the New York State Police Crime Laboratory. The motion was seconded by Dr. Marciano. Mr. Epstein asked the moving party to amend their motion to table the vote until the next meeting based on the lack of clarity on several issues, which was denied. The motion by Mr. Fitzpatrick was approved with 8 votes (Banbury, de Castro, Fitzpatrick, Marciano, O'Neill, Palmer, Rauch, and Schmitz), and 4 opposed (Epstein, Goldthwaite, Murphy, and Willey). A follow-up motion was made by Ms. Murphy to

00:14:08 –
01:21:28

01:12:00 –
01:14:59

01:16:51 –
01:18:44

hold a public hearing regarding the use of single nucleotide polymorphism (SNP) testing by New York State accredited forensic laboratories before approval of this methodology by the Commission. This was seconded by Ms. Goldthwaite. The motion was approved with 11 votes (Banbury, de Castro, Epstein, Goldthwaite, Marciano, Murphy, O'Neill, Palmer, Rauch, Schmitz, and Willey), and 1 opposed (Fitzpatrick).

The Commission then reviewed and discussed the New York State Police Crime Laboratory's validation and the binding recommendation from the DNA Subcommittee to approve the use of the ANDE Rapid DNA Identification System for Rapid DNA. Commissioner Rosado returned to the meeting at 12:53pm. The following members left during the discussion and were not present for the vote: Ms. de Castro (12:52pm), Mr. Epstein (12:52pm), Mr. Fitzpatrick (1:12pm), and Dr. Chithalen (2:15pm). Dr. Marciano made a motion to accept the binding recommendation and approve the use of the ANDE Rapid DNA Identification System for Rapid DNA analysis on single source reference samples at the New York State Police Crime Laboratory. The motion was seconded by Ms. Schmitz and approved with 8 votes (Banbury, Marciano, O'Neill, Palmer, Rosado, Rauch, Schmitz and Willey), 1 opposed (Goldthwaite), and 1 abstention (Murphy).

01:21:30 –
01:54:02

01:53:10 –
01:54:02

The Commission continued by reviewing the New York State Police Crime Laboratory's ANAB reaccreditation assessment documentation and the binding recommendation from the DNA Subcommittee. Ms. Rauch made a motion to accept the binding recommendation from the DNA Subcommittee and issue full renewal of the laboratory's New York State Accreditation concurrent with their ANAB accreditation. Ms. Schmitz seconded the motion, and it was approved with 8 votes (Banbury, Marciano, O'Neill, Palmer, Rosado, Rauch, Schmitz and Willey), 1 opposed (Goldthwaite), and 1 abstention (Murphy).

01:54:16 –
01:56:02

01:55:00 –
01:56:02

Due to time constraints, Ms. Palmer then paused the Accreditation discussion and went into New Business to review two new applications for New York State Forensic Laboratory Accreditation. After a brief discussion, Ms. Palmer requested a motion to grant New York State Forensic Laboratory Accreditation to the Monroe County Sheriff's Office Latent Print Laboratory for a period concurrent with their ANAB accreditation. The motion was made by Ms. Schmitz, seconded by Ms. Rauch, and approved unanimously (Banbury, Goldthwaite, Marciano, Murphy, O'Neill, Palmer, Rosado, Rauch, Schmitz, and Willey). Mr. Epstein returned virtually at 1:39pm. Then, after another discussion, Ms. Palmer requested a motion to grant New York State Forensic Laboratory Accreditation to the Rockland County Sheriff's Office Latent Print Unit for a period concurrent with their ANAB accreditation. The motion was made by Ms. Schmitz, seconded by Dr. Willey, and approved unanimously (Banbury, Epstein, Goldthwaite, Marciano, Murphy, O'Neill, Palmer, Rosado, Rauch, Schmitz, and Willey).

01:56:22 –
02:08:20

02:03:37 –
02:04:13

02:07:09 –
02:07:48

Commissioner Rosado left the meeting at 1:40pm and Dr. Scott O'Neill left at 1:46pm. The Commission then returned to agenda item 5 to review additional Accreditation/Laboratory Updates. Matters regarding the following laboratories were considered: Erie County Medical Examiner's Office Forensic Toxicology Laboratory, Monroe County Crime Laboratory, Monroe County Office of the Medical Examiner Forensic Toxicology Laboratory, Nassau County Office of the Medical Examiner Division of Forensic Toxicology, New York City OCME Department of Forensic Toxicology, New York City Police

02:08:31 –
02:14:19

Department Police Laboratory, Onondaga County Medical Examiner's Office Forensic Toxicology Laboratory, Suffolk County Medical Examiner Toxicology Laboratory, Westchester County Department of Laboratories & Research Division of Forensic Toxicology, and Yonkers Police Department Forensic Science Laboratory. Representatives from the laboratories were available in person or via Zoom to respond to members' questions.

The next agenda item was Old Business. Ms. Palmer provided the Commission members with a verbal update on the Familial Search Program. Next, the Commission moved to the OSAC thank you letter sent to the forensic laboratories.

02:14:20 –
02:15:10

The Commission then returned to New Business to discuss the initiative by the Office of Forensic Services to bring Commission members to visit laboratories across the state. Ms. de Castro returned virtually at 1:48pm but due to connectivity issues was unable to participate in any voting. The Commission then moved on to the amended agenda item and discussed the recent policy developments for the Department of Health (DOH) regarding private forensic laboratories. Mr. Epstein left at 1:55pm. A motion was made by Dr. Marciano for OFS to create a draft letter to be reviewed at the next Commission meeting regarding modernization and updated efforts for the support of forensic science. The motion was seconded by Ms. Murphy and approved unanimously (Banbury, Goldthwaite, Marciano, Murphy, Palmer, Rauch, Schmitz, and Willey).

02:15:12-
02:34:2502:32:37 –
02:34:17

A motion was then made by Ms. Rauch to table the laboratory disclosures until the next meeting on September 18th, 2026. The motion was seconded by Dr. Willey and approved unanimously (Banbury, Goldthwaite, Marciano, Murphy, Palmer, Rauch, Schmitz, and Willey).

02:34:38–
02:34:54

Ms. Palmer then stated the next Commission meeting will take place on September 18, 2026, with the location to be determined. A motion to adjourn was made by Ms. Schmitz, seconded by Dr. Willey, and approved unanimously (Banbury, Goldthwaite, Marciano, Murphy, Palmer, Rauch, Schmitz, and Willey).

02:35:04 –
02:35:21

Note: Video of the meeting is available at <https://www.youtube.com/user/nyspublicsafety>